

What can be learned from natural analogue studies in view of CO2 leakage issues in Carbon Capture and Storage applications? Geochemical case study of Sainte-Marguerite area (French Massif Central)

Frédérick Gal, Michel Brach, Gilles Braibant, Claire Bény, Karine Michel

▶ To cite this version:

Frédérick Gal, Michel Brach, Gilles Braibant, Claire Bény, Karine Michel. What can be learned from natural analogue studies in view of CO2 leakage issues in Carbon Capture and Storage applications? Geochemical case study of Sainte-Marguerite area (French Massif Central). International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control, 2012, 10, pp.470-485. 10.1016/j.ijggc.2012.07.015. hal-00723404

HAL Id: hal-00723404 https://brgm.hal.science/hal-00723404

Submitted on 9 Aug 2012

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

| 1 | What can be learned from natural analogues studies in view of CO ₂ leakage issues in |
|----|---|
| 2 | Carbon Capture and Storage applications? Geochemical case study of Sainte- |
| 3 | Marguerite area (French Massif Central). |
| 4 | |
| 5 | GAL Frédérick, BRACH Michel, BRAIBANT Gilles, MICHEL Karine, BENY Claire |
| 6 | |
| 7 | BRGM (Bureau de Recherches Géologiques et Minières) |
| 8 | Metrology, Monitoring and Analyses Division |
| 9 | 3 Avenue C. Guillemin |
| 10 | BP36009 |
| 11 | 45060 Orléans cedex 1, France |
| 12 | |
| 13 | Phone : + 33 (0)2 38 64 38 86 |
| 14 | Fax: + 33 (0)2 38 64 37 11 |
| 15 | |
| 16 | E-mail : <u>f.gal@brgm.fr</u> |

18 Abstract

Natural analogues studies have received much interest over past years through the CO₂ 19 20 capture and storage applications. In this paper we focus on one natural analogue in leakage situation in order to describe the nature of the gas leakage, its interaction with surrounding 21 22 rocks and aquifers and its behaviour over time. Soil gas and water monitoring techniques are 23 used to gather point and continuous records. Leakage occurs along discrete sections relying on the nature of surface formations and the permeability of discontinuities. Main gas vents are 24 perennial, relative proportions of different gas phases (CO₂, ²²²Rn and ⁴He) being dependent 25 from the interaction with surface deposits and the distance to main tectonic pathways. 26

Mineral waters were also monitored as they represent integrative bodies that exist above 27 nearly all CCS sites. Constraints on chemical processes occurring at depth are brought by 28 characterisation of the dissolved constituents and by related isotopic systematics. Such 29 30 determination of mixing processes and their influence is important, as leakage from CCS site 31 may be evidenced through the mixing of the water from the storage complex and overlying 32 aquifers. Longer term monitoring was conducted for physico-chemical parameters 33 highlighting noticeable variations for pH, dissolved oxygen, redox potential and dissolved CO₂. 34

35

36 Keywords

- 37 Natural analogue
- 38 Carbon Capture and Storage
- 39 Soil gas monitoring
- 40 Water monitoring

42 <u>1. Introduction</u>

43 Natural analogues studies have received much interest over past years through the prism of CO₂ capture and storage (CCS) applications. Several references on this topic may be found in 44 45 very recent papers such as e.g. Schütze et al. (2012). Natural analogues can either be in steady state conditions, *i.e.* in a non-leaking state, or at the opposite they can experience more or less 46 developed leakages. In this paper we choose to focus on this second situation in order to 47 48 evaluate how valuable information may be learnt from natural CO₂ leakages and extrapolated 49 to CCS sites. In this particular case of leaking analogues, features devoted to the study of storage integrity are by definition unrealistic. Nevertheless, such analogues represent a good 50 51 opportunity to illustrate what must be avoided for CCS sites (Bachu, 2003).

Even if vertical gas flows are often much greater than those expected in case of undesired CO₂ leakage from CCS site, natural analogues provide the opportunity to study the nature of a gas leakage, its interaction with surrounding rocks and aquifers, its behaviour over time or its potential impacts on surface environments (Lewicki *et al.*, 2007). Consequently, natural analogues monitoring is an appropriate way to study natural seepages and is from the authors' point of view complementary with induced leak experiments such as the ZERT (Spangler, 2010) or the CO2FieldLab ones (http://www.sintef.no/Projectweb/co2fieldlab/).

The Sainte-Marguerite site allows the study of both CO₂ leakage in shallow aquifers and gas escapes in near surface environments. Apart from pressure and temperature consideration, leakage in aquifers is the most critical parameter to assess for ensuring of CCS sites integrity. One must be confident with near surface monitoring technologies prior to use them in deeper environments. Second, monitoring of CO₂ escapes as a gas phase may consist in the ultimate warner prior to leakage in the atmosphere. Health and risk assessment and public acceptance directly rely on those two aspects.

Another interesting parameter to evaluate is the behaviour of natural analogues over long time 66 periods. CO₂ injection is a very recent process compared to timescale of geological processes. 67 Consequently, apart from failures linked to defective constraint of a CCS site (leakage due to 68 69 abandoned wells, existence of fractures or leakage through the caprock; Lemieux, 2011), leakage may occur at low rate over years and may not be highlighted by monitoring 70 71 technologies at depth, especially geochemical ones that rely on discrete measurements. A better understanding of how the gas migrates from depth and how it imprints surface 72 73 environments is a challenging question that may be addressed by studying naturally leaking 74 sites. Defining the origin of the gas phase is an important issue in case of leakage at a CCS site, helping to decipher whether the gas originates from the reservoir itself or from other 75 76 sources that do not involve CCS processes (e.g. Gilfillan et al., 2011).

77

78 The Sainte-Marguerite area belongs to the French Massif Central and more precisely to the 79 southern part of the Limagne d'Allier basin (Figure 1). This tertiary basin is mainly filled by 80 limestones with frequent sandy-clayey intercalations that are contemporary of the Oligocene 81 to Miocene West European rifting. Alluvial and colluvial deposits from the Allier River partly overlie these tertiary strata and from place to place volcanic series crosscut the sedimentary 82 83 formations. Mineral waters emerging in the Limagne d'Allier basin are strongly influenced by 84 their deep circulation in the crystalline basement and the occurrence of deep CO₂ sources (Fouillac, 1983). The main tectonic structures, inherited from the Hercynian orogeny, are 85 respectively N10-N30 and N110-N130 (Merle and Michon, 2001). The Sainte-Marguerite 86 87 area is also characterised by the presence of travertine deposits formed from water degassing at springs (Casanova et al., 1999; Fouillac, 1983; Rihs et al., 2000). 88

89 While studies on mineral waters – mostly of sodium bicarbonate type with CO_2 present as a 90 gas phase – from the Allier River valley are numerous (*e.g.* Négrel *et al.*, 1997a and 91 references therein), initial investigations of soil gas composition in the Sainte-Marguerite area
92 were performed during the 90's to locate new boreholes for perpetuating the commercial
93 exploitation of this water (Appora-Gnekindy, 1992; Baubron *et al.*, 1992). Earlier
94 measurements were made in the 70's on the west bank of the Allier River at the Saladis spring
95 (Batard *et al.*, 1978).

The objective of this study is therefore, in light of the work done in the 90's, to compare the similarities and differences of gas emanations separated by 20 years. Point measurements and longer records will be used to examine the relationships existing between the near surface compartment and deeper seated processes.

- 100
- 101 Figure 1
- 102

103 <u>2. Methods</u>

Two types of investigative methods were used: soil gas characterisation and description of water flows. Soil gas measurements were made using procedures and equipment identical to those described by the authors elsewhere (*e.g.* Battani et al., 2010; Gal and Gadalia, 2011). The monitoring methodology was based on the following:

CO₂, O₂ and CH₄ soil gas concentrations were directly quantified in the field using
landfill gas analyser (LFG20 gas analyser, ADC Gas Analysis Limited, UK). Gas
content was measured at 1 m depth in order to minimize the effect of atmospheric
gases. CO₂ and CH₄ contents were determined by non-dispersive infrared absorption
and O₂ contents by electrochemistry. No CH₄ was found during the successive surveys
indicating concentrations lesser than 0.01% volume in the gas phase. As the CO₂
concentrations ranged from less than 1% up to 100%, precision of the measurements

115 varied between $\pm 0.5\%$ of the reading for $CO_2 < 10\%$ to $\pm 5\%$ of the reading for $CO_2 >$ 116 50%.

⁴He and ²²²Rn concentrations were also systematically determined using samples collected in Tedlar bags for ⁴He and vacuumed scintillating flasks for ²²²Rn, respectively. Concentrations were obtained using mass spectrometry for ⁴He (Adixen ASM102S leak detector, France) and scintillation counting for ²²²Rn (Calen, Algade, France).

 $\begin{array}{rcl} 122 & - & \text{Some additional grab samples were collected for laboratory determination of the } \delta^{13}\text{C} \\ 123 & \text{of the CO}_2\text{. The isotopic ratio was determined using a Delta S Thermo/Finnigan mass} \\ 124 & \text{spectrometer and expressed as } \% \text{ VPDB (Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite). A Varian 3400} \\ 125 & \text{gas chromatography was used for the determination of } N_2\text{, Ar, } O_2\text{, CO}_2\text{ and } C_nH_{2n+2} \text{ (n} \\ 126 & = 1 \text{ to } 6\text{).} \end{array}$

Continuous data acquisition was also performed on ²²²Rn content using Barasol probes
 (absorption spectrometry via a silicon detector; Algade) for long-term acquisitions
 (from October 2008 to March 2010). Barasol probes were protected by a PVC tube,
 covered by a Goretex membrane and buried at 1 m depth in the ground.

131

The joint determination of these gaseous species allow to compare information from tracers that may be enriched through geothermal reservoir processes (⁴He), from poorly mobile elements that may help highlight areas with significant gas fluxes (222 Rn) and from a widely existing gas (CO₂) that may be tracer of soil/atmosphere exchanges or of deep seated endogenic processes. Weather conditions were also taken into account for the interpretation of the soil gas data and will be discussed together with the data.

Secondly, as the Sainte-Marguerite area is known for its mineral water resources, chemical 139 characterisation of some springs (physico-chemical parameters and dissolved ions content) 140 141 was also performed as well as the monitoring of the Brissac Geyser during several hours using a multi-parameter Idronaut probe (Idro316Plus). Dissolved ion contents were determined at 142 laboratory using ICP-AES (Inductively Coupled Plasma – Atomic Emission Spectroscopy) 143 and chromatographic methods. Isotope ratios were measured by gas phase mass spectrometry 144 $(\delta^{18}O \text{ and } \delta D \text{ are expressed in }\% \text{ VSMOW} - \text{Vienna Standard Mean Oceanic Water}). The$ 145 Idronaut probe was used to monitor the short-time evolution of temperature, pH, specific 146 147 conductance, dissolved oxygen, redox potential and dissolved CO₂ content of the water.

148

149 3. Gas and water measurements

150 <u>3.1 Soil gas data</u>

A dataset of nearly 1000 data points for each gas specie (CO₂, ²²²Rn and ⁴He) is available,
half of them from the 90's measurements and the rest from more recent measurements (Table
1).

154

155 Table 1

156

157 CO_2 concentrations range from values close to those of the atmosphere up to 100% vol. The 158 frequency distributions are different between the two measurement periods in relation to the 159 spatial arrangement of the measurements that is dictated by the tectonic and geological 160 structure of the study area. As a consequence, the mean CO_2 concentration is significantly 161 greater for the 2006-2010 dataset than for the 1992 dataset.

162 Radon-222 (²²²Rn) concentrations also fall within similar ranges during the two periods,

163 minimum values being close to 150 Bq.m⁻³ and greater ones around $2x10^6$ Bq.m⁻³. The mean

values were again higher for the 2006-2010 period as a consequence of data acquisition mainly focused on the Western part of the area. Nevertheless the variation of mean concentrations is only a factor of two whereas it was a factor of four for CO₂ concentrations.

167 Helium-4 (⁴He) concentrations are on average quite close to the atmospheric content but this 168 value hides important differences. Both in 1992 and 2006-2010 some measurements showed 169 very strong depletions when compared to the atmospheric content while others had strong 170 enrichments (\geq 10 ppm).

171

Most of the CO_2 measurements made between 2006 and 2010 were also supplemented by measurements of the O_2 concentrations in soils. A very homogeneous inverse behaviour exists between those species (Figure 2). Almost all data exhibit an O_2 decrease that is not proportional with the increase of the CO_2 content on a per mole basis. Depletion of O_2 is much faster with a factor close to 5. This suggests that CO_2 is supplied in abundance by a powerful process probably related to a deep gas source (crustal and/or mantle origin) as will be discussed later.

179

180 Figure 2

181

This strong O_2 depletion is also confirmed by the gas chromatography measurements reported in Figure 3. Correlations with other gas species follow linear regression with r^2 between 0.991 and 0.998, and also suggest a different behaviour between the CO_2 end-member and the N_2 - O_2 -Ar triptych, with CO_2 becoming predominant as the other three gases diminish and viceversa. This was particularly true for a 30 m deep borehole where atmospheric constituents were only detected at trace levels (0.13% N_2 ; 0.023% O_2 ; 0.002% Ar). Using the relationship presented in Figure 3, it is then possible to recalculate an average composition for the

| 189 | atmospheric end-member. Ar and N_2 contents were respectively at 0.932% and 79.6%, levels |
|-----|--|
| 190 | that are very close to those usually reported for the atmosphere (respectively 0.934 and |
| 191 | 78.08%; http://encyclopedia.airliquide.com/). Unlike O2, which is subject to a more active |
| 192 | kinetic of replacement, N_{2} and Ar are diluted in the soil gas by equimolar replacement with |
| 193 | CO ₂ . |
| 194 | |
| 195 | Figure 3 |
| 196 | |
| 407 | |

Finally, the δ^{13} C isotope ratio of the CO₂ gas was also evaluated on these samples and ranged between -3 to -5.1‰ VPDB for CO₂ in the 14 – 100% vol. range.

- 199
- 200

201 <u>3.2 Water measurements</u>

202 The main physico-chemical properties of mineral springs sampled during the study are listed 203 in Table 2. A rain event collected in October 2008 is also reported for comparison. The 204 emergence temperatures range between 16 and 30°C and pH between 6.2 and 7.2, therefore 205 comparable to those reported by Négrel et al. (1997b) for the carbogaseous waters known 206 throughout the French Massif Central. Specific conductances vary between 2.5 and 8.4 mS.cm⁻¹, Chapelle springs (used for bottling) having total mineralization approximately half 207 of other sampled waters. The mineralization is dominated by HCO_3 (1.3 to 4 g.L⁻¹), Na (0.3 to 208 1.5 g.L⁻¹) and Cl (0.2 to 1.5 g.L⁻¹). If this Na-Cl-HCO₃ facies predominates, the Ca and Mg 209 amounts, less variable (respectively 120 to 310 mg.L⁻¹ and 100 to 140 mg.L⁻¹), allow the 210 211 Chapelle springs – due to their lower dissolved elements concentrations – to be linked with 212 the Ca-Mg pole, suggesting a secondary enrichment associated with the chemical hardness of 213 bicarbonate-rich waters (Michard et al., 1981). Similarly, the Chapelle springs have an

oxidizing character contrary to Tennis and Geyser Brissac waters that are characterized by a
marked reducing character. Characteristics of isotope ratios reported in Table 2 will be
discussed in section 5.

217

218 Table 2

- 219
- 220

221 <u>4. Interpretation of soil gas data</u>

222 <u>4.1 Point data</u>

223 One of the first steps to considered for highlighting a potential leakage at a CCS site is to 224 characterise the CO₂ phase. Concentration measurements are of great interest but they may 225 not be sufficient *e.g.* in case of small leakage rate. Additional information may be gathered 226 using isotope systematics, mobile systems nowadays allowing on-site measurements (e.g. 227 Picarro or Aerodyne lasers). δ^{13} C isotope ratio measurements will not give direct indication of 228 the process that may be involved in the production of the CO₂ phase but will allow 1) to 229 discriminate between several origins and 2) to discard some unrealistic origins.

230 In the case of Sainte-Marguerite, CO₂ concentrations in soils are supposed to evolve primarily 231 under the influence of deep seated processes rather than surface processes. Indeed, the range of $\delta^{13}C_{CO2}$ isotope ratios in soil gas (-3 to -5.1‰) is related to deep crustal and/or mantle 232 degassing (-4 to -8%; Gerlach and Taylor, 1990). Similarly, $\delta^{13}C_{CO2}$ are close to ratios 233 234 measured on the gaseous phase of low helium concentrated, CO₂-rich waters from the Massif 235 Central (-6.4%; Dégranges et al., 1978). The more depleted ratio (-5.1%) was measured in the 30 m borehole, where the gas phase was 100% CO₂ with no 4 He (< 0.05 ppm), whereas 236 237 soil gas measurements (1 m depth) were slightly enriched in carbon-13 (i.e. greater than -4.8%). This slight isotopic enrichment of upper soil horizons may be the result of two 238

complementary phenomena, first the percolation of CO₂ through surface aquifers (δ^{13} C of dissolved carbon from local springs close to 10.2‰; Mercier, 1987) and second the interaction with travertine deposits (δ^{13} C between 5.4 and 7.7‰; Casanova *et al.*, 1999).

242

In the case of leakage originated from a CCS site, such characterisation using the only δ^{13} C isotope ratio will be much more difficult as overlaps between several gas origins and frequent re-equilibration will certainly occur. A way to better constrain gas emanation is to measure other gas species with different chemical properties.

In the present study we mainly refer to 222 Rn and 4 He. As 222 Rn and 4 He are only present as trace levels in the free atmosphere (respectively around 50 Bq.m⁻³ or less and 5.24 ppm), an enrichment would favour the existence of phenomena occurring either in the soil or in the upper regolith (222 Rn) or deeper in the ground (4 He; Battani *et al.*, 2010; Gilfillan *et al.*, 2011). Relationships between CO₂, 222 Rn and 4 He are presented in Figure 4.

252

253 Figure 4

254

For ²²²Rn/CO₂ and ⁴He/CO₂ couples, graphical relationships (Figure 4A) confirm the different 255 256 origin of these two gases and highlight that the genesis of ⁴He from radioactive decay of uranium in the near surface has little influence on the ⁴He concentrations. This should also 257 result in an increase of the ⁴He concentration when ²²²Rn activities are high. This is not the 258 case, since there is rather a gradual depletion when the ²²²Rn activities exceed 10⁶ Bq.m⁻³ 259 (Figure 4A). Moreover, these high ²²²Rn concentrations are measured at precise locations 260 261 which correspond to surface discharges of springs (old factory and Tennis; Figure 1) that form tens of centimetres to several meters thick travertine beds. These very high ²²²Rn activities are 262 263 presumably related to these travertines, consequently richer in uranium than the alluvial

formations and the local waters (Casanova *et al.*, 1999). In this particular case, the CO_2 source is not strong enough to dilute the ²²²Rn as may occur farther from travertine deposits. As a consequence, perennial ²²²Rn high concentrations exist locally.

The behaviour of ²²²Rn and CO₂ is also complex for ²²²Rn concentrations lesser than 300,000 267 Bq.m⁻³ (Figure 4B). Two distinct trends seem to exist, one with fast ²²²Rn enrichment with 268 low CO₂ concentrations (red squares), and the other with weaker ²²²Rn enrichment when CO₂ 269 concentrations rise (blue lozenges). These two behaviours correspond to various spatial 270 locations (Figure 5). Most of the "high 222 Rn – low CO₂" samples plot on the eastern part of 271 the site on sedimentary deposits (mean altitude 350 to 365 m), whereas the majority of the 272 "low ²²²Rn – high CO₂" group is restricted to a lower terrace of the Allier river (westward 273 274 from longitude 669,100 in Figure 5 – mean altitude 335 to 345 m; see also Battani et al., 2010 275 for geological cross-section). Near the Allier River, the thickness of geological formations 276 overlying permeable paths is lesser than eastward. The CO₂ gas interacts to a lesser extent with surface formations, leading to moderate ²²²Rn enrichment. On the contrary, on the 277 278 eastern part of the site, CO₂ has to go through thicker formations (alluvial and Oligocene formations), leading to smaller CO₂ amounts and also to ²²²Rn enrichment due to the 279 percolation of the CO₂ into these formations. An intermediate behaviour occurs above 280 travertines deposits (Figures 4 and 5) where the ²²²Rn content is also dependent from the 281 282 uranium content of these formations. An additional process can also act in a complementary fashion. Deep CO₂ may be less diluted on the western part of the site than on the eastern part, 283 284 indicating a more pronounced upward flow that allows the dilution of radon signal (Baubron, 285 1992; Gal et al., 2011).

No relationship can be highlighted for the 4 He/CO₂ couple except from a very weak tendency of having slightly lower 4 He concentrations when CO₂ concentration is greater than 50% (Figure 4A). If considering the 30 m depth borehole as the most representative of the deep end-member, then uprising gas flow is ⁴He depleted. A strong CO_2 flux can act as a flushing agent on ⁴He. For lesser CO_2 amounts, flushing effect may be less important and ⁴He concentrations are higher or even enriched depending on the amounts of ⁴He upward migrating.

293

Figure 5

295

The great variability of soil gas concentrations on a small area is not only dependent from deep processes but also from the heterogeneity of surface formations and pathways. Such a problematic is critical for CCS sites especially in areas where potential leakage pathways are not well characterised. This will raise the question on how detect surface leakage if *e.g.* a leakage occurred in deep groundwaters. Nevertheless, a positive point is the persistence of leakage structures over years.

302 As a result, the Sainte-Marguerite area presents a patchy repartition of anomalies at surface, 303 as evidenced by the equal concentration lines reported on Figure 6. Data are interpolated using natural neighbour algorithm. This interpolation method is more rugged than e.g. 304 305 kriging, but it has the advantage in not extrapolating the contours beyond the convex hull of 306 the dataset. The whole dataset is presented top of Figure 6. Separate contributions from the 307 data acquired during the 90's and during the 2000's are respectively presented middle and 308 bottom parts of Figure 6. A good match is highlighted between these 15-year interval datasets 309 especially on the Western part of the study site where strong CO₂ enrichments remain 310 perennial. The match cannot be achieved for the Southern part as a new bottling facility has 311 been built in between time therefore no measurement is yet possible. The North-South to N10 312 anomalous zone is well in agreement with structural directions reported in the Limagne d'Allier basin (Merle and Michon, 2001). This direction is also suggested by variogram 313

314 computations (data not shown) which suggest, under a spherical model, a significant nugget 315 effect (40% of the variability) and a reduced leg (20 m). Consequently, there seems to be at 316 site scale a structure directly related the Hercynian tectonic and at a smaller scale a less 317 obvious structure that is difficult to model even with a large amount of data.

For CCS site management, this suggests that once fed by seepage or microseepage, a leakage
pathway will remain active over a long time period. Its characterisation will then be possible
but remediation actions will be very difficult to undertake.

321

322 Figure 6

323

The complex CO₂ distribution in soils is not restricted to this gas phase. A well characterised 324 time coherence for ²²²Rn concentrations (90's and 2000's datasets) also exists and reveals an 325 326 anomalous area close to the flow axis of the Allier river (Figures 2 and 6). A N170 direction is suggested by variogram calculations, with a leg identical to that defined for CO₂ but with 327 increased nugget effect (50% of the variability). This may be linked to the location of the area 328 of maximum ²²²Rn concentrations, close to the high CO₂ area but with no coinciding peaks, 329 330 and due to the difference of origin for these two gases, radon being preferentially produced in shallower environments than CO_2 in the present case. 331

332

The evolution of ⁴He concentrations in the area where ²²²Rn and CO₂ anomalies are located is very interesting to detail (Figure 6). This area is characterized by a complex intricacy of positive and negative anomalies in helium *i.e.* tracing enrichment or depletion with respect to the atmospheric content. This complexity in ⁴He emanations is remarkably stable over time. Low ⁴He concentrations are preferentially measured along a N10 axis, locally reinforced by a 338 complementary N160 direction. The adjustment on a spherical model of the variogram339 suggests a maximum correlation distance of 40 m between two points without a nugget effect.

340

In order to better assess the behaviour of CO₂, ²²²Rn and ⁴He, a linearization of the data was 341 342 made using the scheme proposed by Michel - Le Pierrès et al. (2010). The resulting interpolation map is presented in Figure 7. By assumption, CO_2 and ⁴He are considered as 343 deep end-members and ²²²Rn as a near surface produced gas. This is consistent with gas 344 345 origins suggested by Jeandel et al. (2010) that found a nearly half/half mantle/crust origin for 346 helium and a predominant crustal origin for CO₂. This strengthens previous results indicating that CO₂ and ⁴He amounts are not directly proportionally linked. The linearization process is 347 then intended to lower the influence of ²²²Rn and to over-estimate the one of ⁴He by assigning 348 a value between 0 and 1 to each of the gas specie. The 0.05 to 100% CO₂ range is restricted in 349 the 0 - 1 interval and so on for ²²²Rn (140 to 248,000 Bq.m⁻³) and ⁴He (0.05 to 9.83 ppm). 350 Using this procedure, ⁴He concentrations account for *c.a.* 75% of the total variability, CO_2 for 351 22% and 222 Rn for the rest (*c.a.* 3%). Despite this bias introduced in the dataset (Figure 7), the 352 353 surface geometry of the anomalies is still primarily guided by the distribution of CO₂ concentrations, the influence of ⁴He been of second order. Consequently, it is the deep CO_2 354 355 source that governs the spatial distribution of anomalies in soil gas through the N10-N30 and 356 N110-N130 structures (Merle and Michon, 2001). Other gaseous species evolve either 357 through the heterogeneous composition of the regolith or through the existence of complex 358 phenomena including convective transport, stripping or mixing. This strong imprint of geological structures on the occurrence of anomalies also appears in the comparison of data 359 360 acquired 15 years apart, since changes between these two periods remain small. This 361 statement is strengthened by comparison with CO_2 flux data available in the area (Battani et al., 2010). The most anomalous CO_2 areas correspond to those marked by fluxes reaching or 362

exceeding 500 cm³.min⁻¹.m⁻², while the radon anomalies are superimposed on areas where the fluxes are smaller (lesser than 100 cm^3 .min⁻¹.m⁻²).

365

366 Figure 7

367

368 <u>4.2 Time evolution of soil gas concentrations</u>

Evaluation of short-term variability of soil gas concentrations was evaluated using point 369 measurements (CO₂, ²²²Rn and ⁴He) and continuous measurements (on the CO₂ phase using 370 371 Fourier Transform Infrared gas spectrometry). Repeated point measurements over 3 days (points 1 to 4 in Figure 1) indicated that the points located northward of the site experienced 372 373 low variability of their gas concentrations (\pm 60% for CO₂). At the opposite points located in the southern part of the site had much greater variations rising up to a factor of 80 for CO_2 and 374 200 for ²²²Rn (point 4). Continuous measurements in upper soil horizons in the vicinity of the 375 376 Brissac Geyser had an intermediate variation factor of 8 over few hours, with periodicity 377 influenced by the geyser own kinetic (mean period of 21 minutes).

378 Assessing the variability of gas emanations at short time scale is important for the comprehension of phenomena occurring at a natural analogue, but such a time scale is not 379 fully matching requirements of CCS site monitoring. Longer chronicles shall be available in 380 381 order to highlight any deviation from environmental background noise. The Sainte-Marguerite site has then been instrumented for longer-term measurements. They were performed only on 382 the ²²²Rn phase for practical reasons. Even if deviations that may be recorded will not be 383 384 linked to deviations from an environmental background noise in the present case, one must be confident in the capacity of monitoring devices to properly register unexpected events. 385

Points 2 and 4 (Figure 1) were instrumented with Barasol probes from October 2008 to January 2009 for hourly monitoring and afterwards only the point 4 remained. Soil temperature and barometric pressure were simultaneously recorded at 1 m depth in the soil. Meteorological data were got from an airport weather station located 14 km NNW from Sainte-Marguerite, at similar altitude. Two distinct time responses exist (Figure 8):

Pressures measured at 1 m depth in soils perfectly replicate the variations of
 atmospheric pressure and provide accurate description of local evolutions (Figure 8a);

Temperatures measured in the soil are different from those measured in the atmosphere (Figure 8b). Soil temperatures exhibit a smoother daily variability and are higher than atmospheric temperatures. There is a time-lag between the maxima of temperature in the atmosphere and in the soil, the former occurring 5 to 6 hours before the later.

In December 2008 and January 2009, there is however a difference between temperatures measured by the two probes (Figure 8b). The probe located in the southern part of the study area (point 4 in Figure 1) recorded higher temperatures (from 5 to 10°C) than those measured a few hundred meters northward (point 2 in Figure 1). Point 4 being located in a depression close to mineral springs (25 to 29°C at the orifice), this warming may be related to their influence into higher groundwater level during winter times.

404

405 Figure 8

406

Radon activities measured by the 2 probes during the October 2008 - January 2009 period
showed trends with site-specific evolution but the variability of the measurement remained in
a similar range (Figure 8c). There is a good agreement between average ²²²Rn concentrations
computed from Barasol records (Table 3) and that from point measurements performed at site

411 scale (Table 1). Marked activity peaks nevertheless occurred. At the end of January 2009 (Figure 8c), phenomenal concentrations were reached (up to 80×10^6 Bq.m⁻³). Such 412 concentrations remain under saturation threshold of the probe (10^9 Bq.m^{-3}) but are far greater 413 than maximum values found during spot sampling $(2.5 \times 10^6 \text{ Bg.m}^{-3})$. During this January 2009 414 event, a perfect synchronism was found between the 2 probes with a very quick increase 415 followed by very small ²²²Rn amounts few hours later. This event is therefore not related to 416 417 malfunctioning of the equipment. The measurements suggest a gas burst sweeping the area of Sainte-Marguerite, leading to a huge increase in ²²²Rn and a subsequent strong depletion. 418 419 Concentrations remained low until radioactive decay produced again a sufficient amount of ²²²Rn. Another peak of activity was also detected in September 2009 (Figure 8c). However, as 420 421 only one sensor was deployed and as it experienced some operational problems, we prefer not 422 trying to interpret this latter signal.

423

424 Table 3

425

426 Apart from these specific periods, the ²²²Rn concentrations change cyclically (Figure 8).
427 Cycle analysis returned variable results depending on the analysed time period and even on
428 the location of the probe (Table 3). There was no clear influence of external forcing such as
429 daily or diurnal variations over long time periods or the existence of pulsation of longer
430 duration. It is therefore not possible to highlight regular gas emanations as may be possible
431 regionally such as in the vicinity of Lake Pavin (Gal and Gadalia, 2011).

432 Nevertheless, during periods characterised by less noisy ²²²Rn signals (March 2009; Figure
433 9a, b and c), a daily cyclicity (24 hours period) clearly appeared even if trends of greater
434 wavelength may also contribute to the shape of the recorded signal (Figure 9d). Principal
435 Component Analysis were calculated by combining the factors accounting for maximum

variability (Figures 9e and f). The only apparent trend was an inverse correlation between
²²²Rn concentration and soil temperature. Given the interdependence between soil and
atmospheric temperature, this trend can be extended to this second parameter. Thermal
forcing seemed to be more efficient than pressure gradients to influence the short-term
temporal evolution of ²²²Rn concentrations, apart from sudden phenomena such as "gas
bursts".

- 442
- 443 Figure 9
- 444

As previously described, the occurrence of large ²²²Rn concentration peaks was very 445 intriguing. The origin of such short pulses may typically be attributed to external causes such 446 as earthquakes. Radon is frequently used as an indicator of crustal movement (precursor), 447 although each earthquake does not raise an ²²²Rn anomaly and each anomaly is not 448 449 necessarily followed by an earthquake (e.g. Al-Hilal et al., 1998). According to dislocation model (Fleischer, 1981; Fleischer and Mogro-Campero, 1985), variations of ²²²Rn 450 451 concentrations issued from stress changes can be detected even at great distances from 452 epicentres, involving a wide set of mechanisms (Kharatian et al., 2002). Continuous measurements of ²²²Rn in soil gas sometimes allow the identification of spike-like anomalies 453 454 just before the earthquake, the post-seismic stage being characterised by a rapid return to natural background values (Chyi et al., 2002). Although highly variable, increases in ²²²Rn 455 456 concentrations at 1 m depth in soils (Wattananikorn et al., 1998) often occur between 4 and 15 days before earthquakes of magnitude 2 to 6 with distances from the epicentre to the 457 458 measuring station comprised between 15 to 250 km (Das et al., 2006; Ghosh et al., 2007; 459 Ramola et al., 2008).

Referring to these constraints, we searched the available databases (http://www-dase.cea.fr/) 460 for events reported in an area covering 4 degrees in longitude and 3 degrees in latitude, 461 462 centered on Sainte-Marguerite. Twelve earthquakes were recorded between January 28 (12 hours after the ²²²Rn peak) and February 13 (17 days after the ²²²Rn peak) within this area, at 463 464 distances between 40 and 70 km from Sainte-Marguerite. All were characterised by very low magnitudes less than 2.5. Although some of the cited literature reports a sensitivity of ²²²Rn 465 measurements for low seismic magnitudes, no clear relationship exists in the present case 466 between ²²²Rn peaks and tectonic activity. 467

Such excursions of ²²²Rn signal were earlier reported on the Weyburn site, which is not known to be tectonically active (Riding and Rochelle, 2009). Phenomena observed at Weyburn were short (3 hours) and activities varied by factors of 7 to 15. At Sainte-Marguerite variations were consequently higher (100 to 1000 times) and the sensitivity of ²²²Rn concentrations to pressure changes was less obvious than stated at Weyburn. This renders improbable an origin related to transient phenomena affecting the pressure.

Even if not really successful during the monitoring period, long-term measurements of soil gas emanations are of strong interest in view of CCS applications. Data main not only be gathered on the 222 Rn phase but mostly on CO₂ and/or O₂ phases. This is crucial for assessing if variations are linked to natural processes, either originated from surface processes or deeper ones, or caused by CCS operations. Continuous monitoring is not designed to cover great areas, one limiting factor being costs, but is complementary with point techniques and may be deployed in most prominent locations highlighted by point monitoring.

481

482 <u>5. Chemistry of mineral waters</u>

483 The Sainte-Marguerite site offers the opportunity to monitor gas escapes into more or less 484 mineralised water bodies. We will first describe water chemical compositions and then 485 discuss what is important in view of long term water monitoring.

486

487 <u>5.1 Point sampling</u>

Mineralisation of these waters form two groups, one rich in dissolved constituents and 488 belonging to the Na-Cl-HCO₃ end-member, the other (Chapelle springs) more influenced by 489 the Ca and Mg species. This distinction remains when referring to δ^{18} O and δ D isotope ratios 490 491 (Table 2). Chapelle springs are always under the local meteoric water line (Fouillac et al., 492 1991), *i.e.* enriched in heavy isotopes contrary to other springs which fall on this meteoric 493 water line. This may be related to evaporation (Négrel et al., 1997b and references therein), to 494 mixing in various proportions between deep and surface end-members (e.g. Michard et al., 495 1981) or to mixing between different deep end-members (Négrel et al., 1997b; Rihs et al., 496 2000). These differences in isotope ratios denote spatial disparities within walking distance 497 but do not imply the existence of compartmented geological structures. Theoretical calculations of the ¹³C isotope signature of gas in equilibrium with the waters provide ratios 498 499 between -2.8 and -5.1‰ (Table 2) that exactly match the range measured in soil gas. Water 500 mixing must then occur under open system conditions allowing different end-members to 501 interact one with each other, pro parte explaining temporal variations reported in the area 502 (Négrel et al., 1997b).

503 Strontium isotope ratio of water (87 Sr/ 86 Sr) is known to derive from that of minerals with 504 which the water interacts and to be lower than that of the whole rock, in response to different 505 dissolution rates between the mineral species (*e.g.* Michard *et al.*, 1978). 87 Sr/ 86 Sr ratios 506 (Table 2) suggest that Tennis and Geyser Brissac waters fall in the range of ratios known 507 across the Limagne d'Allier (0.71338; Stettler, 1977) and therefore reflect the signature of a 508 deep end-member. Lower ratios of Chapelle springs suggest either an interaction with lithologies different from those present in the supply circuit of Tennis and Geyser Brissac 509 510 springs (e.g. plagioclase from the Coudes granite at 0.71028; Rihs et al., 2000) or a mixing 511 with near surface groundwaters (ratio close to 0.71102; Négrel et al., 1997b). In the first case 512 (mixture of 2 groundwaters, one coming from plagioclase weathering), a contribution of the 513 deep end-member (represented by Geyser Brissac or Tennis springs) close to 32% can be calculated using a binary mixing law, whereas in the second case (dilution by surface water), 514 515 the proportion of the deep end-member may be close to 57%.

516

517 Using this deep end-member - or at least the end-member less affected by mixtures -518 equilibrium temperatures with basement rocks may be evaluated referring to cationic 519 geothermometers. As geothermometers induce the existence of equilibrium between waters 520 and rocks, we neither refer to Ca and Mg geothermometers, strongly affected by mixing 521 processes (Michard et al., 1981), nor to silica -rich species, oversaturated with water at the 522 spring orifice. Na/K (Michard, 1979, 1990, Truesdell, 1975) and Na/Li (Fouillac and Michard, 1981; Michard, 1990) geothermometers are preferred as saturation indices of 523 524 mineral species containing Na indicate under saturation with water. Deep reservoir temperature is estimated between 180 and 210°C (Na/K) and 195 and 205°C (Na/Li). This 525 526 estimate is in agreement with that of Fouillac and Michard (1981) and Fouillac (1983).

527

Isotope characterisation of waters is often restricted to the monitoring of ¹⁸O, ²H or ¹³C species in view of CCS problematic. Such characterisation is important but water monitoring of deep aquifers, such as the storage complex itself of overlying aquifers, may include other species. O, H, C species may suffer from several processes such as water/rock interaction of mixing between different water bodies. Monitoring other isotopes, such as Sr, Nd, B, Li, Ca 533 or U may also allow getting information on deep seated processes, better define water/rock 534 interaction or describe redox processes. A better comprehension of deep phenomena may 535 allow improved constraint on CO₂ migration in deep horizons if leakage from the storage 536 reservoir may occur.

537

538 <u>5.2 Continuous monitoring of Geyser Brissac</u>

Here we describe short-term evolution of some key physico-chemical parameters of the Geyser Brissac mineral water. Requirements of CCS monitoring will obviously not imply high frequency measurements but one must be confident on the short time scale before assessing variations of longer period.

Results of this monitoring are presented in Figure 10 and Table 4. Two days were characterised by sunny conditions whereas rainfall events of variable magnitude occurred during day 4 and especially day 3. The evolution of dissolved CO_2 is reported on Figure 10 even if quantification is not accurate using pH-based sensors (Gal *et al.*, 2011), in order to bring qualitative information.

548

549 Figure 10

550 Table 4

551

A cyclical pattern is clearly apparent for all the parameters, directly related to Geyser Brissac dynamics (Figure 10). Two parameters mainly influence the water temperature: 1) intrinsic processes, the eruption of the geyser progressively warming the water and 2) atmospheric forcing, higher water temperatures being recorded around 16:00 in the evening. This is due to to the location of the Geyser Brissac, emplaced in a 1 m deep, 5 m diameter bowl filled with mineral water. Measurements were performed at the bottom of this bowl, closest to the drain where the geyser overflows. The presence of non-flowing waters induced the occurrence of thermal forcing on this water mass: time is needed for the water directly flowing from the geyser when it erupts to warm up the bowl. Similarly, amplitude of the temperature peaks becomes smaller through the day and the water mass becomes hotter as solar heats the water mass. Dilution effects due to rainfall may happen and significantly affect the water temperature and the specific conductance (day 3, Table 4).

564 Apart from external causes, time evolution of the records is dependent from the geyser 565 activity. Temperature peaks, which correspond to the maximum of the activity of the geyser, 566 lasted 4 to 5 minutes. They are synchronous to increase of the dissolved CO₂, slight decrease 567 of the pH value (-0.05 pH unit) and decreases of the dissolved O₂ concentration and of the redox potential. Such evolutions are self-consistent and reflect the progressive replacement of 568 O_2 by CO_2 in the bowl as the eruption takes place. Specific conductance is also affected, CO_2 569 570 inflows leading to harmonic variations of the record. Nevertheless, diurnal heating affects the 571 dissolved CO₂ measurements, one of the drawbacks of this sensor elsewhere reported (Gal et 572 al., 2011).

573

574 Spectral density analysis is best constrained using dissolved O₂, pH and redox potential redox. 575 Main period is around 22±1 minutes in good agreement with infrared measurements 576 performed in soils (see section 4.2). As measurements were not conducted over several days, 577 it is not possible to identify periodicity of greater wavelength such as that determined from 578 Barasol probe acquisitions.

579 Long-term monitoring of water bodies is one of the key procedures in order to ensure of the 580 safety of CO_2 storage. Monitoring performed at Sainte-Marguerite natural analogue shows 581 that this method is sensitive to strong CO_2 leakage well over thresholds expected in deeper 582 environments. Nevertheless devices have the capacity to record variations of lower

magnitude. The main issue nowadays existing relies on the stability of the sensors over time. 583 584 Long-term deployment at depth generally involves CTD probes, *i.e.* probes that measure only 585 temperature, specific conductance and depth. This only involves solid state sensors. Idronaut 586 probe has chemical sensors for all other parameters and such sensors are subject to drift. 587 Dissolved oxygen may be better constrained using optical sensors. Until now, no long-term pH or redox monitoring has been reported without frequent recalibration of the devices. This 588 589 question is of crucial importance, as pH is one of the most sensitive parameter to monitor 590 changes linked to CO₂ dissolution.

591

592 <u>6. Concluding remarks</u>

593 This case study of Sainte-Marguerite natural analogue allows investigating both soil gas and594 water compartments.

595 Point soil gas measurements have suggested the presence of perennial pathways that favour 596 gas escape from depth to the surface by comparing data acquired 15 years apart. Leakage does 597 not occur along all the fault length as may be derived from geological maps but rather along 598 discrete sections. At Sainte-Marguerite there is no visual impact on the vegetation as could 599 exist in other similar environments (Krüger et al., 2011; Schütze et al., 2012). Permeability of 600 faults does not exist as a whole mechanism but rather as narrow structures separated by less 601 permeable sections filled by secondary mineralization. In terms of CCS monitoring strategy, 602 this suggests that potential pathways that may be deduced from geological or geophysical 603 works may not be the most prone to become pathways. It would be better to search for 604 structures that are still open to fluid draining *i.e.* secondary fractures that are more likely to 605 have intrinsic permeability than main discontinuities.

606 The CO_2 gas was found to be the main carrier gas leading to the existence of gas anomalies in 607 near surface environments. Carbon isotope ratios are mainly imprinted from deep seated

processes with little interaction in near surface environments either resulting from percolation 608 609 into surface waters or into travertines horizons. Helium concentrations measured in CO2-rich 610 areas also highlighted this strong imprint of crustal contribution (Jeandel et al., 2010). The interaction of fluids with travertine deposits also influenced the ²²²Rn concentrations of the 611 612 gas phase. Consequently, gas emanations were found to be mainly oriented along known 613 regional directions of the tectonics with some complications induced by local surface geology. When alluvial deposits were the less developed the gas emanations were stronger. Thicker 614 615 alluvial deposits were found to be less representative of the deep end-member due to more 616 pronounced interaction with these formations. Gas migration from depth is a highly complex 617 phenomenon that must be better constrained in order to build confidence in safety rules and 618 remediation strategies of CCS projects. Even at the upper level, near surface features have a 619 strong influence on degassing pattern as pointed out by coupled geochemical/geophysical 620 investigations (Schütze et al., 2012).

621 Soil gas surveys performed under "point acquisition" schematic are relevant for the thorough 622 description of surface leakage over a restricted spatial array. They are not fully appropriate for 623 the monitoring of large areas and may be time consuming for repeated data acquisitions. They 624 do not allow to take into account for the variability linked to external causes such as climatic variability and its imprint on surface environments. They are nonetheless crucial to best settle 625 626 monitoring equipment for long-term surveillance. Investigation done at Sainte-Marguerite was mostly oriented on the ²²²Rn specie. It allowed highlighting excursion from background 627 628 noise under "gas burst" event. Such events were characterised by influence radius of at least 629 200 m. Scaling effects in case of leakage from CCS storage may not allow to get such 630 amounts of gases percolating up to the surface.

631 Therefore, there is also a need to monitor integrative bodies such as aquifers. In nearly all632 cases, CCS sites are more or less deep and overlying aquifers exist. Monitoring aquifers in the

case of natural leaking analogues is from one side little frustrating as the initial composition
of the waters is not known – water properties prior leakage from a CCS site are known a
priori – but on the other hand these waters represent an opportunity to study deep degassing
through the interaction with water and rocks – that will be the case for CCS sites. The
harmonic pulsation of Geyser Brissac is an extreme case relying on the accumulation of gas
until the degassing due to overpressure.

639 Point monitoring of waters is by definition subject to heterogeneity of spatial coverage, ways 640 to collect samples being restricted to available outlets or wells. Constraints on chemical 641 processes occurring at depth may be brought by specific characterisation of the dissolved constituents and by related isotopic systematics. Particularly, the determination of mixing 642 643 processes and their influence is important, as leakage from CCS site may be evidenced 644 through the mixing of the water from the storage complex and overlying aquifers. Such 645 methodology is not restricted to dissolved constituents and can also be extended to associate 646 gases such as ⁴He (Gilfillan *et al.*, 2011).

As for soil gases, monitoring at regular frequency of water bodies is complementary with point methods. Time scale of recording depends on the kinetic of the processes. At Sainte-Marguerite such monitoring was performed at high frequency in order to take into account variations over short time scales, cyclicity of the geyser being around 22 minutes. Most prominent variations were stated for pH, dissolved oxygen, redox potential and dissolved CO_2 content. From soil gas measurements it was also stated that geyser "breathing" influences the soil gas evolution over short periods at a radius close to 20-30 m.

654

655 Several conclusions arise when moving from analogue scale to industrial scale. Basically 656 studies devoted to CCS projects separate into baseline data acquisitions, then monitoring 657 actions during the injection and final monitoring operations after well closure and abandonment. Baseline studies are essential as they represent the only data that will allow definition of anomalies during injection and post-injection. Establishing baseline values is a site-specific procedure but often their definition is based on a restricted dataset of measurement over limited time in order to match scientific issues on one side and industrial approach on the other side.

663 Natural analogue monitoring suggests that data acquisition should not be restricted in narrow perimeters above the storage complex itself but should encompass all the areas that may 664 665 potentially be affected by leakage. One of the main concerns is the capability of the 666 monitoring system to detect potential leaks. Anomalies are often restricted on narrow areas at surface and deploying monitoring devices on such small grids (20 to 200 m of array) is 667 668 absolutely unrealistic if only considering costs. At surface, apart from such a net, it is 669 therefore hypothetical to ensure a safely monitoring over great distances simply using 670 punctual and point methods. Installation of equipment just above a potential leaking pathway 671 that may not have been recognized by geological studies would be too lucky to be reproduced 672 regularly over several deep CO₂ storages. Surveying methodologies are nowadays adapted to 673 integrate gas emanations characteristics from hectometer to kilometer scales. Methods such as 674 eddy covariance, open path laser, airborne hyper-spectral monitoring etc... are promising 675 ones but until now they are not as robust as required for storages monitoring as they are often 676 dependent from modeling of the atmosphere compartment that is strongly turbulent over short 677 time periods and may therefore induce undesirable effects and false warnings (e.g. Klusman, 678 2011).

Ways to overcome this limitation may be of several types. Monitoring at depth through boreholes, using geochemical and/or geophysical methods, appears to be the best way to get early detection and warning of unexpected events by focusing on the water phase and on dissolved gas contents. Monitoring should be performed under continuously deployed devices or at least consisting in repeated measurements. Nevertheless, from a geochemical point of
view, lot of the available monitoring equipment that may be deployed at depth has nowadays
not reached the desirable level of reliability over long time periods.

686 Many efforts have been done in recent years to adapt technologies to CCS monitoring and to 687 gain confidence in results, but long-term recording of parameters remains a challenging 688 question.

689

690

691 Acknowledgments

This research was conducted through the fundings of French Research Agency projects Geocarbone Monitoring (2006-2008) and Sentinelle (2008-2011). Anne Bonhomme (Les Mousquetaires Group) is warmly thanked to allow the access to the Sainte-Marguerite site and subsequently fruitful data acquisition. BRGM people that performed laboratory analyses are gratefully acknowledged.

697 Two anonymous reviewers and the associate editor are also warmly thanked for their help in698 improving the manuscript.

699

700 <u>References</u>

Al-Hilal M., Sbeinati M. R., Darawcheh R. (1998) Radon variations and microearthquakes in

Western Syria. Applied Radiation and Isotopes, 49, 117-123.

703

Appora-Gnekindy I. (1992) Etude spatiale et temporelle des émanations gazeuses de quelques

zones thermominérales du Massif Central Français, rapport de stage BRGM, 92 p.

Bachu S. (2003) Screening and ranking of sedimentary basins for sequestration of CO₂ in 707 708 geologic media, Environmental Geology 44(3), 277-289.

709

- 710 Batard F., Billet C., Risler J.J. (1978) Prospection de CO₂ d'origine profonde dans le Massif 711 Central, rapport BRGM 78-SGN-466-MCE, 16 p.
- 712
- Battani A., Deville E., Faure J.-L., Noirez S., Tocqué E., Jeandel E., Benoît Y., Schmitz J., 713
- 714 Parlouar D., Gal F., Le Pierrès K., Brach M., Braibant G., Bény C., Pokryszka Z., Charmoille
- 715 A., Bentivegna G., Pironon J., de Donato P., Garnier C., Cailteau C., Barrès O., Radilla G.,
- 716 Bauer A. (2010) Geochemical study of the natural CO₂ emissions in the French Massif 717 Central: How to predict origin, processes and evolution of CO₂ leakage, OGST, vol. 65, No 4, 718
- 719

615-633.

- 720 Baubron J.C., Mercier F., Rouzaire D. (1992) Eaux minérales de Sainte Marguerite (Puy de 721 Dôme) - Prospection géochimique in situ des gaz des sols, Rapport BRGM R-36492-AUV-722 4S-92, 35 p.
- 723
- Casanova J., Bodénan F., Négrel P., Azaroual M. (1999) Microbial control on the 724 725 precipitation of modern ferrihydrite and carbonate deposits from the Cézallier hydrothermal 726 springs (Massif Central, France), Sedimentary Geology 126, 125–145.
- 727
- 728 Chyi L. L., Chou C. Y., Yang F. T. et al. (2002) Automated radon monitoring of seismicity in 729 a fault zone. Geofísica Internacional, 41, 507-511.
- 730

- 731 Das N. K., Bhandari R. K., Ghose D. et al. (2006) Explosive helium burst in thermal spring
 732 emanations. Applied Radiation and Isotopes, 64, 144-148.
- 733
- 734 Dégranges P., Bosch B., Derec F. (1978) Hélium et sources thermominérales en France,
 735 rapport BRGM 78-SGN-684-MCE, 22 p.
- 736
- Fleischer R. L. (1981) Dislocation model for radon response to distant earthquakes.
 Geophysical Research Letters, 8, 477-480.
- 739
- Fleischer R. L., Mogro-Campero A. (1985) Association of subsurface radon changes in
 Alaska and the northeastern United States with earthquakes. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
 Acta, 49, 1061-1071.
- 743
- Fouillac, C., Michard, G. (1981) Sodium/lithium ratio in water applied to geothermometry of
 geothermal reservoirs. Geothermics 10, 55–70.
- 746
- Fouillac C. (1983) Chemical geothermometry in CO₂-rich thermal waters. Example of the
 French Massif Central, Geothermics, Vol. 12, No. 2/3, 149 160.
- 749
- Fouillac C., Fouillac A.M., Chery L. (1991) lsotopic studies of deep and surface waters in the
 French Massif Central, Proceedings of isotope techniques in water resources development,
 Vienne, 11-15/03/1991, 646-648.
- 753
- Gal F., Gadalia A. (2011) Mesure des gaz des sols autour du système volcanique le plus
 récent de France métropolitaine (lac Pavin, Massif Central). Soil gas measurements around

the most recent volcanic system of metropolitan France (lake Pavin, Massif Central), C. R.Geosciences 343, 43-54.

758

Gal F., Brach M., Braibant G., Jouin F., Michel K. (2011) CO₂ escapes in the Laacher See
region, East Eifel, Germany: application of natural analogue onshore and offshore
geochemical monitoring, International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control, 5, 1099-1118.

762

Gerlach T. M., Taylor B. E. (1990) Carbon isotope constraints on degassing of carbon dioxide
from Kilauea Volcano, GCA, 54, 2051-2058.

765

Ghosh D., Deb A., Sengupta R. et al. (2007) Pronounced soil-radon anomaly - Precursor of
recent earthquakes in India. Radiation Measurements, 42, 466-471.

768

Gilfillan S.M.V., Wilkinson M., Haszeldine R.S., Shipton Z.K., Nelson S.T., Poreda R.J.
(2011) He and Ne as tracers of natural CO₂ migration up a fault from a deep reservoir,
International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control, 5, 1507-1516.

772

- Jeandel E., Battani A., Sarda P. (2010) Lessons learned from natural and industrial analogues
 for storage of carbon dioxide, International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control, 4, 890-899.
- Kharatian K., Travi Y., Igoumnov V. (2002) Activité du gaz radon dans l'air du sol et
 sismicité locale : exemple du bassin de l'Arax (Arménie). Comptes Rendus de Geosciences,
 334, 179-185.

Klusman R.W. (2011) Comparison of surface and near-surface geochemical methods for
detection of gas microseepage from carbon dioxide sequestration, International Journal of
Greenhouse Gas Control, 5, 1369-1392.

- 783
- 784 Krüger M., Jones D., Frerichs J., Oppermann B.I., West J., Coombs P., Green K., Barlow T.,
- 785 Lister R., Shaw R., Strutt M., Möller I. (2011) Effects of elevated CO₂ concentrations on the
- vegetation and microbial populations at a terrestrial CO₂ vent at Laacher See, Germany,
 International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control 5, 1093-1098.
- Lemieux J.-M. (2011) Review: The potential impact of underground geological storage of
 carbon dioxide in deep saline aquifers on shallow groundwater resources, Hydrogeology
 Journal, 19, 757-778.
- 791
- Lewicki J.L., Birkholzer J., Tsang C.-F. (2007) Natural and industrial analogues for leakage
 of CO₂ from storage reservoirs: identification of features, events, and processes and lessons
 learned, Environ Geol, 52, 457-467.
- 795
- Mercier F., avec la collaboration de Ausseur Y. (1987) Fichier des eaux minérales du Puy de
 Dôme, rapport BRGM 87-SGN-780-AUV, 222 p.
- 798
- Merle O., Michon L. (2001) The formation of the West European Rift: A new model as
 exemplified by the Massif central area, Bull. Soc. Géol. France, 172, 2, 81-89.
- 801
- 802 Michard G., Evrard M., Fouillac C., Lambert B. (1978) Acquisition des ions alcalino-terreux
- 803 par les eaux carbogazeuses, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 41, 170–174.
- 804

Michard G. (1979) Géothermomètres chimiques. Bull. Du BRGM (2ème série) Section III 2,
183–189.

807

Michard G., Fouillac C., Grimaud D., Denis J. (1981) Une méthode globale d'estimation des
températures des réservoirs alimentant les sources thermales. Exemple du Massif Central
Français, Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 45, 1199-1207.

811

Michard G. (1990) Behaviour of major elements and some trace elements (Li, Rb, Cs, Sr, Fe,
Mn, W, F) in deep hot waters from granitic areas. Chem. Geol. 89, 117–134.

814

Michel-Le Pierrès K., Gal F., Brach M., Guignat S. (2010) Radon, Helium and CO₂
measurements in soils overlying a former exploited oilfield, Pechelbronn district, Bas-Rhin,
France, J. Env. Rad. 101, 835-846.

818

Négrel P., Fouillac C., Brach M. (1997a) Occurrence of mineral water springs in the the Allier
River (Massif Central, France): stream channel of chemical and Sr isotope constraints, Journal
of Hydrology 203, 143-153.

822

Négrel P., Fouillac C., Brach M. (1997b) Variations spatio-temporelles de la composition
chimique et des rapports ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr des eaux minérales de la Limagne d'Allier, C. R. Acad. Sci.
Paris, 325, 119-124.

826

Ramola R. C., Prasad Y., Prasad G. et al. (2008) Soil-gas radon as seismotectonic indicator in
Garhwal Himalaya. Applied Radiation and Isotopes, 66, 1523-1530.

- Riding J.B., Rochelle C.A. (2009) Subsurface characterisation and geological monitoring of
 the CO₂ injection operation at Weyburn, Saskatchewan, Canada, Geological Society, London,
 Special Publications, 313, 227-256.
- 833
- Rihs S., Condomines M., Poidevin J.L. (2000) Long-term behaviour of continental
 hydrothermal systems: U-series study of hydrothermal carbonates from the French Massif
 Central (Allier Valley), Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, Vol. 64, No. 18, 3189–3199.
- Schütze C., Sauer U., Beyer K., Lamert H., Bräuer K., Strauch G., Flechsig Ch., Kämpf H.,
 Dietrich P. (2012) Natural analogues: a potential approach for developing reliable monitoring
 methods to understand subsurface CO₂ migration processes, Environ. Earth Sci., DOI
 10.1007/s12665-012-1701-4.
- 842
- Spangler L.H. (2010) Foreword to the Special Issue on Zero Emission Research and
 Technology Center testing field site, Bozeman, Montana, USA, Environ. Earth Sci. 60, 225.
- 845
- Stettler A. (1977) ⁸⁷Rb-⁸⁷Sr systematic of a geothermal water-rock association in the Massif
 Central, France. Earth and Planet. Sci, Lett., 34, 432-438.
- 848
- Truesdell A.H. (1975) Geochemical techniques in exploration, summary of section III, In:
 Proceedings Second United Nation Symposium on the development and use of geothermal
 resources, vol. 1, pp. Iiii–Ixiii.
- 852
- Wattananikorn K., Kanaree M., Wiboolsake S. (1998) Soil gas radon as an earthquake
 precursor: some considerations on data improvement. Radiation Measurements, 29, 593-598.
- 855

856 **<u>Figure captions:</u>**

857

Figure 1: location of the study area: dots locate points where soil gas data are available: black dots refer to 2006-2010 data acquisitions, red contoured dots are from the 90's dataset. Red dots represent the main mineral waters that are labelled in the inset. Yellow dots (labelled 1 to 4) represent points where continuous monitoring was performed. Grey lines represent main roads.

863

Figure 2: $O_2 - CO_2$ relationship for the 2006-2010 soil gas measurements; the equimolar replacement line (1 mole $CO_2 \Leftrightarrow 1$ mole O_2) is represented. Model line corresponds to the regression line between the 2 species; the 95% confidence interval of the regression is also indicated.

868

Figure 3: relationships between Ar, N_2 , O_2 and CO_2 concentrations (% vol.) on samples analysed using laboratory gas chromatography (samples from year 2007).

871

Figure 4: A: Relationships between CO₂, 222 Rn and ⁴He in soil gas (2006-2010 dataset); B: detail of the CO₂ - 222 Rn relationship for low 222 Rn concentrations (lesser than 300,000 Bq.m⁻ 874 ³).

875

Figure 5: Relationships between CO_2 , ²²²Rn and ⁴He in soil gas.

877

Figure 6: spatial distribution of soil gas species (from left to right: CO_2 , ²²²Rn and ⁴He) along

879 with time (from top to bottom). Interpolation is done using natural neighbour contouring.

Figure 7: CO₂, ²²²Rn and ⁴He concentrations (2006 to 2010 measurements) recalculated in the 0 – 1 interval to lower the influence of ²²²Rn and strengthen the one of ⁴He (arbitrary units). See text for explanation.

884

Figure 8: a: temporal evolution of pressure for Barasol probes (labelled as F10X) for points 2
and 4 (Figure 1) and comparison with atmospheric data (Clermont-Ferrand Aulnat airport;
<u>http://french.wunderground.com/</u>); b: evolution of soil temperatures and atmospheric
temperature (same chart as for 8a); c: ²²²Rn concentrations over time; blanked areas (F109
probe) correspond to power supply deficiency or to electronical malfunctioning of the ²²²Rn
detector.

891

Figure 9: F109 Barasol probe (point 4 in Figure 1); period from the 26 February 2009 to the
07 April 2009; a: temporal evolution of soil temperature and ²²²Rn concentrations; b: temporal
evolution of atmospheric pressure and ²²²Rn concentrations; c: temporal evolution of
atmospheric temperature and ²²²Rn concentrations; d: spectral densities of ²²²Rn
concentrations; e and f: Principal Component Analysis using these 4 parameters.

897

Figure 10: a: temporal evolution of water temperature of Geyser Brissac during deployment;
b: temporal evolution of temperature (°C), pH, specific conductance at 25°C (mS.cm⁻¹),
dissolved oxygen content (mg.L⁻¹), redox potential (Eh, mV) and dissolved CO₂ (expressed as
a mV value) during the second day of deployment.

903 List of tables:

904

Table 1: statistical parameters for the CO₂, ²²²Rn and ⁴He concentrations during the 90's and
2000's surveys (Sainte-Marguerite area; see Figure 1 for location).

907

Table 2: physico-chemical parameters of mineral waters from the Sainte-Marguerite area (see location in Figure 1). Major ion contents are reported; blanks indicate a non-detection of the specie or a non-measurement (isotope ratios). δ^{18} O and δ D isotope ratios are reported as well as the δ D difference to the local meteoric water line (δ D = 8 δ^{18} O + 13.1; Fouillac *et al.*, 1991). Equilibrium partial CO₂ pressure is computed using Diagrammes software (<u>http://www.lha.univ-avignon.fr/</u>).

914

915 Table 3: descriptive statistics for ²²²Rn concentrations acquired using Barasol probes.

916

Table 4: top: evolution of temperature (°C), pH, specific conductance at 25° C (EC, mS.cm⁻¹), dissolved oxygen content (mg.L⁻¹), redox potential (Eh, mV) and dissolved CO₂ (expressed as a mV value) along the 4 days of monitoring of the Geyser Brissac (monitoring duration indicated into brackets); bottom: correlation matrix for each daily dataset. Geyser Brissac was sampled on day 3 (Table 2).











intermediate tendency





















radon-222 (Bq.m⁻³)





| | CO ₂ (%) CO ₂ (%) | | CO ₂ (%) | ²²² Rn (Bq.m ⁻³) | ²²² Rn (Bq.m ⁻³) | ²²² Rn (Bq.m ⁻³) | ^₄ He (ppm) | ^₄ He (ppm) | ⁴ He (ppm) |
|---------------------|---|-------|---------------------|---|---|---|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| | all data | 1992 | 2006-2010 | all data | 1992 | 2006-2010 | all data | 1992 | 2006-2010 |
| nb. of measurements | 1058 | 504 | 554 | 913 | 503 | 410 | 917 | 431 | 486 |
| minimum | 0.05 | 0.08 | 0.05 | 144 | 148 | 144 | < 0.05 | 2.58 | < 0.05 |
| maximum | 100 | 91.40 | 100 | 2482000 | 1930000 | 2480000 | 17.68 | 17.68 | 9.83 |
| 1st quartile | 1.40 | 1.18 | 3.31 | 15800 | 17000 | 13800 | 5.19 | 5.24 | 5.04 |
| median value | 4.64 | 1.70 | 15.76 | 39800 | 37000 | 43200 | 5.24 | 5.30 | 5.22 |
| 3rd quartile | 24.08 | 5.10 | 47.00 | 80000 | 71000 | 97400 | 5.34 | 5.36 | 5.26 |
| mean value | 18.66 | 7.07 | 29.21 | 81700 | 57200 | 112000 | 5.30 | 5.42 | 5.19 |
| standard deviation | 27.23 | 13.48 | 31.90 | 189700 | 105000 | 250000 | 0.76 | 0.81 | 0.69 |
| coeff. of variation | 1.46 | 1.91 | 1.09 | 2.32 | 1.84 | 2.28 | 0.14 | 0.15 | 0.13 |

| Sample | т | рН | cond@25°C | Eh | Ca | Mg | Na | к | Fe(III) | Mn | Sr | Li | HCO ₃ | CI | SO ₄ | PO₄ | NO ₃ | F | Br | SiO ₂ | δ ¹⁸ Ο | δD | theoretical δD | ⁸⁷ Sr/ ⁸⁶ Sr | ¹³ C _{gas} |
|------------------------|------|------|-----------|------|--------|--------|--------|--------|---------|--------|--------|--------|------------------|--------|-----------------|--------|-----------------|--------|--------|------------------|-------------------|-----------|----------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| | (°C) | | (µS.cm⁻¹) | (mV) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (mg/l) | (% VSMOW) | (‰ VSMOW) | if belonging to LMWL | | open sys. |
| Chapelle 1 (2006) | 17.8 | 6.54 | 5210 | 338 | 237 | 121 | 776 | 81.9 | | | 3.74 | | 2288 | 717 | 146 | | 4.9 | | | | -8.3 | -57.4 | -53.3 | 0.712298 | -4.6 |
| Chapelle 1 (2007) | 16.6 | 6.63 | 4530 | 391 | 248 | 137 | 875 | 97.4 | | | 4.37 | 4.48 | 2465 | 806 | 155 | | 2.8 | 0.7 | 1.8 | | | | | | -5.1 |
| Chapelle 2 (2006) | 18 | 6.21 | 3070 | 336 | 196 | 117 | 304 | 34.5 | | | 2.5 | | 1276 | 298 | 192 | | 6.3 | | | | -7.5 | -53.7 | -46.9 | 0.712818 | -2.8 |
| Chapelle 2 (2007) | 16.6 | 6.33 | 3130 | 444 | 188 | 127 | 360 | 39.1 | | | 2.38 | 1.66 | 1483 | 340 | 202 | | 4.4 | 0.9 | 0.7 | | | | | | -3.4 |
| Chapelle 3 (2006) | 17.5 | 6.38 | 2730 | 340 | 178 | 104 | 266 | 34.6 | | 0.02 | 2.16 | | 1410 | 230 | 198 | | 8.3 | | | | -7.7 | -54 | -48.5 | 0.712035 | -3.7 |
| Chapelle 3 (2007) | 15.9 | 6.51 | 2410 | 420 | 184 | 126 | 301 | 40.7 | | | 2.30 | 1.52 | 1332 | 315 | 209 | | 4.6 | 1.0 | 0.6 | | | | | | -4.5 |
| Tennis (2006) | 29.2 | 6.48 | 7970 | 91 | 306 | 131 | 1493 | 163 | | 0.10 | 6.37 | | 3554 | 1495 | 101 | | | | | | -9.6 | -63.2 | -63.7 | 0.713388 | -3.9 |
| Tennis (2007) | 29 | 6.46 | 7970 | 140 | 295 | 135 | 1486 | 167 | | | 6.66 | 8.03 | 3515 | 1348 | 129 | | | 0.5 | 3.7 | | | | | | -3.9 |
| Tennis (2008) | 28.5 | 6.58 | 8440 | 138 | 301 | 133 | 1461 | 163 | 2.75 | | | | 3527 | 1370 | 111 | 0.4 | | 1.1 | | 107 | -9.5 | -62.8 | -62.9 | | -4.4 |
| Geyser Brissac (2006) | 24.6 | 6.65 | 8180 | 186 | 307 | 133 | 1497 | 163 | | 0.10 | 6.33 | | 4135 | 1429 | 100 | | | | | | -9.6 | -63 | | 0.713387 | -4.9 |
| Geyser Brissac (2007) | 23.5 | 6.62 | 7990 | 180 | 297 | 136 | 1485 | 167 | | | 6.88 | 7.99 | 3534 | 1355 | 126 | | | 0.4 | 3.7 | | | | | | -4.8 |
| Geyser Brissac (2008) | 23 | 6.57 | 8310 | 158 | 299 | 132 | 1447 | 162 | 2.80 | | | | 3562 | 1360 | 111 | 0.5 | | 1.1 | | 106 | -9.5 | -62.7 | -62.9 | | -4.6 |
| Petit Saladis (2007) | 21.6 | 6.58 | 8190 | 245 | 295 | 136 | 1498 | 168 | | | 6.29 | 8.13 | 3554 | 1344 | 125 | | | 0.5 | 3.5 | | | | | | -4.7 |
| Grand Saladis (2007) | 16.1 | 7.24 | 7920 | 386 | 125 | 139 | 1579 | 180 | | | 2.60 | 8.52 | 3124 | 1414 | 108 | | 11.0 | 0.4 | 3.9 | | | | | | -7.6 |
| old plant sp. (2008) | 29.3 | 6.7 | 8270 | 140 | 302 | 133 | 1457 | 164 | 2.41 | | | | 3147 | 1390 | 110 | 0.4 | | 0.8 | | 105 | -9.5 | -63 | -62.9 | | -4.9 |
| Valois sp. (2008) | 25.3 | 6.45 | 7840 | 105 | 298 | 129 | 1461 | 163 | 2.80 | | | | 3536 | 1370 | 109 | 0.4 | | 1.2 | | 106 | -9.5 | -62.9 | -62.9 | | -3.9 |
| terrace sp. (2008) | 18.6 | 6.45 | 8410 | 197 | 296 | 131 | 1459 | 163 | 2.44 | | | | 3566 | 1360 | 111 | 0.3 | | 1.2 | | 102 | -9.6 | -62.8 | -63.7 | | -4.1 |
| rainwater (08/10/2008) | 12.4 | 8.45 | 65 | 273 | 4.2 | 0.9 | 8.3 | 1.2 | 0.03 | | | | 24 | 6 | 2 | | 1.7 | | | 0.7 | -8.8 | -64.7 | -57.3 | | -9.2 |

| radon-222 (Bq.m ⁻³) | POINT 2 | | POI | NT 4 | |
|---|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|---------------------|
| DATA greater than 10 Bq.m ⁻³ | 06/10/08 → 28/01/09 | 06/10/08 → 28/01/09 | $\textbf{26/02/09} \rightarrow \textbf{01/09/09}$ | 11/09/09 → 16/03/10 | 06/10/08 → 16/03/10 |
| nb of meas. (hours) | 2728 | 2729 | 3869 | 740 | 7338 |
| hours of deployment | 2735 | 2735 | 4471 | 4459 | 11665 |
| Min. value | 60 | 30 | 50 | 1030 | 30 |
| Max. value | 2.69E+05 | 2.14E+05 | 9.09E+05 | 9.80E+05 | 9.80E+05 |
| 1st Quartile | 5820 | 20900 | 2410 | 5890 | 9640 |
| Median value | 28500 | 51700 | 4810 | 7500 | 16800 |
| 3rd Quartile | 102000 | 71500 | 13600 | 10700 | 12500 |
| Mean value | 56500 | 65300 | 28700 | 26300 | 31300 |
| std. dev. | 66400 | 57600 | 73600 | 93200 | 66100 |
| PEAK values: nb of meas. | 3 | 4 | 1 | | |
| PEAK values: Max. value | 8.57E+07 | 7.06E+06 | 1.24E+06 | | |
| Cycle analysis | no cycle | 7 - 10 - 22 hours | 15 - 25 - 39 - 74 hours | 24 - 58 hours | |
| | | 5.5 days | | | |

| DESCRIPTIVE | day 1 (74 | 400 data) | | | | day 2 (8300 data) | | | | | | day 3 (13800 data) | | | | | | day 4 (15800 data) | | | | | |
|--------------------|-----------|-----------|----------------|------|------|-------------------|------|-----------------------|------|------|-------|--------------------|----------------|------|--------|-------|------|-----------------------|------|-------|--|--|--|
| STATISTICS | Т° | EC | O ₂ | рН | Eh | Т° | EC | O ₂ | рН | Eh | Т° | EC | O ₂ | рН | Eh | т∘ | EC | O ₂ | рН | Eh | | | |
| minimum | 21.15 | 8505 | 7.7 | 6.75 | 1.1 | 23.14 | 8512 | 7.9 | 6.74 | 31.6 | 21.98 | 7621 | 5.3 | 6.40 | -162.1 | 22.05 | 8477 | 5.9 | 6.43 | -61.4 | | | |
| maximum | 23.89 | 9184 | 10.8 | 6.80 | 29.7 | 23.88 | 8567 | 12.3 | 6.80 | 70.1 | 23.66 | 8264 | 18.0 | 7.28 | 206.2 | 23.00 | 8639 | 14.5 | 7.81 | 128.9 | | | |
| mean value | 23.62 | 8532 | 9.2 | 6.78 | 20.5 | 23.62 | 8537 | 9.7 | 6.78 | 54.2 | 22.54 | 8061 | 9.9 | 6.83 | 69.2 | 22.57 | 8535 | 9.2 | 6.84 | 57.7 | | | |
| standard deviation | 0.16 | 37 | 0.5 | 0.01 | 7.1 | 0.16 | 4 | 0.9 | 0.01 | 7.4 | 0.13 | 72 | 1.1 | 0.03 | 12.4 | 0.17 | 7 | 0.9 | 0.02 | 15.0 | | | |